

## NORTH LANARKSHIRE COUNCIL

## REPORT

To: ENVIRONMENTAL SERVICES COMMITTEE		Subject: BEST VALUE REVIEW OF JANITORIAL AND CARETAKING SERVICES
From: HEAD OF FACILITY SUPPORT SERVICES		
Date: 7 <sup>th</sup> MAY 2008	Ref: GP/IW	

### 1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 A Best Value Service Review of the Janitorial and Caretaking services was undertaken as part of the council's arrangements to ensure best value and compliance with the Local Government in Scotland Act 2003. The review by the Building Cleaning service, was part of the then Department of Community Services' Service Review Programme 2006/2007 and agreed by the Corporate Best Value Working Group. This review has now been completed and this report presents the main findings of the full best value service review report and background documentation and outlines the proposals in the improvement action plan for janitorial and caretaking services.

### 2. REVIEW PROCESS

2.1 A general framework was developed for the review process that ensured that each review would carry out certain key activities. These are detailed below:

- Determine the scope of the review
- Examine the existing service against the criteria for best value in the legislative guidance and identify any gaps to be actioned
- Carry out consultation with all appropriate stakeholders
- Gather and analyse benchmarking data
- Agree the criteria and the weighting for scoring the options with stakeholder groups
- Identify a range of options for service delivery and carry out an initial assessment
- Determine a short list of options
- Carry out an option appraisal exercise on the viable options and score them
- Prepare a detailed improvement action plan
- Senior management overview
- Ensure the appraisal process is cross cutting through involvement of representatives from Learning and Leisure
- Prepare draft report
- Subject the review to the council's peer review procedure
- Report to committee for approval
- Implementation, with regular monitoring of progress
- Annual update on the progress of the action plans to committee

### 3. BACKGROUND

- 3.1 The existing service delivery model for Janitorial services is based around the building being used as a school and resources are scheduled to support the school teaching day, Monday to Friday. This is the case in both Primary and Secondary Schools, where Janitors are contracted to be in the building generally from 7am to 4.30pm, with some variation in start and finish times to meet local requirements during term time. The working week is reduced outwith term time to reflect demand on the service.
- 3.2 The demands on school buildings have changed with the trend towards using schools as community facilities. This is reflected in the Council's Education 2010 and Schools and Centres 21 projects where the buildings have been designed to allow school and community use beyond the teaching day. Schools are now designed as a community hub and used for a variety of school and community activities, in many cases to late into the evening and over weekends.
- 3.3 In order for the existing service delivery model to meet school and community needs, the service has 'stretched' its resources to provide services in the evenings and at weekends. This has been achieved through the goodwill of existing employees working additional hours rather than by the redistribution of resources to cover the whole day demand. Whilst this has provided the necessary cover, it does not represent best use of resources. A revised service delivery model is required which matches resources to the demand of the whole day, covering both school and community use and takes account of the need for a work/life balance for the employees delivering the service.
- 3.4 The growth of letting activity in community centres where a caretaking service is provided has also led to caretakers taking on additional hours to meet demand. Service demand has grown considerably in recent years and has not been reflected in a growth of resources. Consequently employees are being asked to work additional overtime hours on a regular basis to meet community needs. Again this has provided the necessary cover but does not represent best use of resources. As demand within community facilities fluctuates, the impact on individual employees can vary considerably.

#### **4. MAIN REVIEW CONSIDERATIONS AND PROPOSALS**

- 4.1 A hybrid approach to maximise service delivery and customer satisfaction is proposed through:

- improved in house delivery
- reconfiguration of certain elements of working hours practices

These improvement options have been selected from a number of possible options and are proposed as those deemed to best meet the needs of stakeholders. The recommendations are designed to assist compliance with Working Time Regulations.

- 4.2 While the existing service delivery model has high levels of customer satisfaction, the review process has shown that does not comply with the working time regulations and does not represent best use of resources or value for money to the Council. It is proposed to introduce a service delivery model based on a 3 Janitor establishment in all secondary schools. This will utilise a rotating three shift system and create 4 full time additional janitor posts in secondary schools which currently have only 2 janitors. This model provides service flexibility, meets stakeholder needs, meets working time regulations, creates new posts and will provide financial savings of £100,000.

- 4.3 It is proposed to create 14 additional part-time Janitorial posts in primary schools which currently have high levels of overtime working. This will provide service flexibility, meet stakeholder needs, meet working time regulations, create new posts and will provide financial savings of £20,000.
- 4.4 Further consideration will be given to enhancing the role of Secondary School Senior Janitors to include cluster management of the Janitorial Service in surrounding Primary Schools. This development will provide local management responsibility for Senior Janitors and will be recognised as a first level post within the Facility Support Services management structure. It will assist succession planning and help ensure that the service has the capability to provide a well managed efficient service in the future.
- 4.5 Arrangements for frost firing and security checks at weekends are still in place for schools whose janitors commenced employment prior to 2000. This arrangement has ceased for new employees after this date. This element of service is therefore not provided in all North Lanarkshire schools and Learning and Leisure Services indicate that this activity is no longer required through modernisation of school heating plant and also improved security measures carried out under the Towards Safer Schools programme. It is proposed that negotiation takes place to cease the frost firing/security arrangements.
- 4.6 A number of community centres have significant and regular high levels of demand. This means that current work patterns places additional burdens on existing Caretaking employees which cannot be seen to be best practice. It is therefore proposed to create additional part-time caretaker posts in 11 community centres with high levels of overtime working. This will provide greater service flexibility, meet stakeholder needs, meet working time regulations, create new posts and will provide financial savings of £10,000.
- 4.7 The detailed improvement action plan is attached as Appendix 1.
- 4.8 The full report on the Best Value Review for Janitorial and Caretaking Services and appendices associated with this review have been placed in the members' library.

## 5. **RECOMMENDATIONS**

It is recommended that members:-

- 5.1 Authorise officers to consult with trade unions and Learning & Leisure Services on the proposals for a revised model for janitorial service delivery.
- 5.2 Approve the development of a new janitorial service level agreement with Learning & Leisure Services based on the outcome of the best value service review.
- 5.3 Otherwise approve the Best Value Service Review improvement action plan.



**GRAHAM PATRICK**  
Head of Facility Support Services

**Appendix 1**

**BEST VALUE IMPROVEMENT ACTIONS**

Priority	Key Action	Measures/Outcomes	Target Timescales	BV Map Ref.	Corporate Priority	One-Off (Costs) /Savings £	On-going (Costs) /Savings (per year) £	Officer Responsible
<b>DIVISION : FACILITY SUPPORT SERVICES</b>								
<b>Section : Building Cleaning</b>								
<b>1</b>	<b>Janitorial</b>							
	Introduction of shift working into all Secondary Schools, utilising a rotating three shift system. Creation of 4 full-time additional Janitor Posts in Secondary School currently with only 2 Janitors	Community use of Secondary Schools will be more readily available, Service users will receive a more seamless service, Improvement in work/life balance for staff, Compliance with Working Time Regulations	March-2010		1, 2, 3, 4, 5		£100,000	Building Cleaning Service Manager / Operations Manager
	Further develop the role of the secondary school senior janitor to include responsibility for cluster management of the janitorial service in surrounding primary schools	Service Delivery will be managed at local level, ensuring that service user's varying demands can be fully met and to provide career development opportunities and improve succession planning	March-2010		3, 4, 5		To Be Confirmed	Building Cleaning Service Manager / Operations Manager
	Introduction of additional part time working in Primary Schools with significant levels of consistent overtime working. Creation of new Posts in Schools which currently have sustained levels of overtime working	Community use of some Primary Schools will be more readily available. Service user will receive a more seamless service. Improvement in work/life balance for staff. Compliance with Working Time Regulations	March-2010		1, 2, 3, 4, 5		£20,000	Building Cleaning Service Manager / Operations Manager
	Provide a Customer Information guide on Service Delivery	Improved understanding by customer of Janitorial Service Delivery	March-2010		3, 4, 5	(£1,000)		Building Cleaning Service Manager / Operations Manager

Priority	Key Action	Measures/Outcomes	Target Timescales	BV Map Ref.	Corporate Priority	One-Off (Costs) /Savings £	On-going (Costs) /Savings (per year) £	Officer Responsible
<b>DIVISION : FACILITY SUPPORT SERVICES</b>								
<b>Section : Building Cleaning</b>								
	Introduction of a Janitorial Service Level Agreement based on the outcome of the Best Value Service Review	Improved understanding and effectiveness of Janitorial Service Delivery	March-2009		3, 4, 5			Building Cleaning Service Manager / Operations Manager
	Cessation of Frost Firing/Security payments to some Janitorial Staff	Improvement in work/life balance for staff - Compliance with Working Time Regulations - Consistent practice across Janitorial Service	March-2010		3	Buy-out costs unknown	To Be Confirmed	Building Cleaning Service Manager / Operations Manager
<b>2</b>	<b>Caretaking</b>							
	Introduction of term time working in 11 identified centres with significant levels of Overtime - Overtime payment reduction	Improved access to community facilities letting system - Service user will receive a more seamless service. Improvement in work/life balance for staff. Compliance with Working Time Regulations.	August-08		1, 2, 3, 4, 5		£10,000	Building Cleaning Service Manager / Operations Manager/Ass't Op's Manager
<b>3</b>	<b>Demand Matching</b>							
	Review how we can match facility use more closely with stakeholder demand i.e. maximisation of Asset utilisation and minimising duplication – Northline -Customer-Caretaking	Council working group examining this issue - facilitated by Vanguard Consulting. The Groups output will be implemented		3.2.4, 5.2.3	2, 3, 4, 5	Unknown till Working Group Outcome	Unknown till Working Group Outcome	Building Cleaning Service Manager/Operations Manager Unknown till Working Group outcome
<b>4</b>	<b>a) Training</b>							

Priority	Key Action	Measures/Outcomes	Target Timescales	BV Map Ref.	Corporate Priority	One-Off (Costs) /Savings £	On-going (Costs) /Savings (per year) £	Officer Responsible
<b>DIVISION : FACILITY SUPPORT SERVICES</b>								
<b>Section : Building Cleaning</b>								
	Improved staff training to provide greater flexibility of service delivery	Service user will receive a more seamless service			2, 3, 5		(£5,000)	Area Manager (Training)
	<b>b) Reduction in Absence Levels</b>							
	Review the Absence Management system, processes and management support to identify more efficient use of the system to continue to reduce Absence figures for Building Cleaning	Reduce Absence figures to 6.0% for 2007/2008 and then 0.1% reduction year on year as per Service Improvement plan.	April-2009	4.1.3, 4.1.4	5		Saving will accrue once 5% level of Absence is reached	Operations Manager / Administration Manager
<b>5</b>	<b>Job Evaluation</b>							
	Identify the impact of Job Evaluation & Single Status on the Janitorial & Caretaking Service.	Implementation of Job Evaluation Pay and Grading Report	December-2007 (Complete)	8.3.1, 9.1.2	4, 5		(£200,000)	Building Cleaning Service Manager
<b>6</b>	<b>Monitoring and Reporting</b>							
	a) Development of Managers Checklist for Building Cleaning to encompass Janitorial	Have checking and monitoring system to assist in compliance, preventions of failure and identify potential improvements	August-2008		5		0	Operations Manager
	b) Development of a Caretaking version of the Building Cleaning Managers Checklist	Have checking and monitoring system to assist in compliance, preventions of failure and identify potential improvements	August-2008		5		0	Assistant Operations Manager
	<b>c) Communication</b>							

Priority	Key Action	Measures/Outcomes	Target Timescales	BV Map Ref.	Corporate Priority	One-Off (Costs) /Savings £	On-going (Costs) /Savings (per year) £	Officer Responsible
<b>DIVISION : FACILITY SUPPORT SERVICES</b>								
<b>Section : Building Cleaning</b>								
	i) Systems Information Bases, to be rolled out to include Janitors	Common Information Bases across all Sites	August-2008	10.1.1	5	(£5,000)		Operations Manager
	iii) Monitor progress and satisfaction by conducting :-	Survey Reports - Commence June 2007		4.1.5, 5.3.5	5			Customer Services Manager
	> Customer Satisfaction surveys	Janitorial - To be conducted quarterly			5			
	> Introduction of Stakeholder Questionnaires for caretaking service	Caretaking - To be linked into invoice process			5			
	<b>d) Public Performance Reporting</b>							
	i) Reporting of Complaints	Complaints now included as part of Corporate Performance Management Framework		2.1.2, 2.1.5	5		0	
	Caretaking Performance Report	Develop performance report for Caretaking to demonstrate performance management	December-2008		5		0	Assistant Operations Manager
7	<b>a) Disclosure</b>							
	Implement retrospective Disclosure Scotland checks for Janitorial Staff	Completion of Disclosure Checks	June-2007 (Complete)		5		(£20,000)	Operations Manager
Retrospective Disclosure checks now complete								
						<b>Savings Total</b>	<b>£99,000</b>	

\*Key : - Council's Priority Themes 2008 - 2012 – 1. Health and Wellbeing; 2. Environment; 3. Lifelong Learning; 4. Regeneration; 5. Service and People First