

## REPORT

To: CORPORATE SERVICES COMMITTEE	Subject: DESIGN SERVICES - APPROVED PARTNERING ARRANGEMENTS WITH CONSULTANTS 2009-2011
From: HEAD OF DESIGN SERVICES	
Date: 30 September 2009	Ref: DC/LC

**1.0 INTRODUCTION**

- 1.1 The purpose of this report is to address excess design workload requirements until 2011.

**2.0 BACKGROUND**

- 2.1 The Housing & Technical Services Committee approved the current partnering arrangements with Consultants at the meeting held on 7<sup>th</sup> December, 2006.
- 2.2 At that time, it was intended that these arrangements would remain in place until 2009.

**3.0 REPORT**

- 3.1 Tender documents were re-issued to establish further partnering agreements for consultancy services until 2011. All eligible firms from the previous partnering arrangements and firms who have expressed an interest for this work, were invited to tender.
- 3.2 The returned percentage rates were inserted within a matrix of provisional values for housing and non-housing workloads, and the returned offers evaluated on a 60% quality, 40% price basis.
- 3.3 The evaluation on a quality/price basis was undertaken in accordance with the CIPFA tender evaluation model. The outcome of the evaluation process is detailed in Appendix 1 of this Report.

**4.0 PROPOSAL**

- 4.1 By application of the above, it is proposed that the Council appoint the Consultants identified below on a project by project basis, as and when required, to progress matters in accordance with the requirements of the Services until 2011.

## **Report – Design Services – Approved Partnering Arrangements with Consultants 09/11**

### **Architects**

1. CRGP Architects & Surveyors
2. G5 Architecture & Design Ltd
3. Cullen Lochhead & Brown
4. WNP Architects

### **Building Surveyors**

1. CRGP Architects & Surveyors
2. Towler & Hyslop Chartered QS

### **CDM Co-ordinators**

1. CDM Project Safety Ltd
2. CDM (Scotland) Ltd

### **Mechanical Engineers**

1. Davie & McCulloch
2. Forbes Leslie
3. Wallace Whittle
4. NIFES Consulting Group

### **Quantity Surveying**

1. Carr, McLean & Watson
2. Robert C Brown
3. DMA Partnership Ltd
4. Ewing Sommerville Partnership Ltd

### **Structural/Civil Engineers**

1. Pick Everard
2. AJ Balfour Associates
3. Scott Wilson
4. DC Farquhar & Partners

## **5.0 RECOMMENDATION**

That the Committee note the Report and approve the appointment of the consulting firms as detailed at 4.1 of the Report.

  
**Head of Design Services**

Members seeking further information on the contents of this Report are asked to contact Danny McConnell, Contract Support & Administration Manager on 01698 504074.

**Architects**

<u>Firm</u>	<u>Price 40%</u>	<u>Quality 60%</u>	<u>Combined Score</u>
CRGP Architects & Surveyors	27.14	54.60	81.74
G5 Architecture & Design Ltd	24.78	55.20	79.98
Cullen Lochhead & Brown	28.07	51.60	79.67
WNP Architects	28.36	50.60	78.96
Angus Design Associates Ltd	25.93	51.40	77.33
Artemis Architects Ltd	24.92	51.40	76.32
Dearle & Henderson Consultancy Ltd	21.38	54.80	76.18
The Miller Partnership	23.02	52.40	75.42
Dunwoodie Architecture & Design	24.80	50.40	75.20
GCA Architects Ltd	22.03	50.80	72.83
Hypostyle Designs Ltd	18.91	53.80	72.71
DDP (Scotland) Ltd	21.36	51.20	72.56
Craig & Struthers	18.22	51.80	70.02
Lawrence McPherson Associates	16.23	52.80	69.03
Mast Architects	16.53	51.40	67.93
Construction Design Architects	24.02	43.80	67.82
Archial Group	12.85	54.00	66.85
The Kerr Practice - Chartered Architects	18.06	45.60	63.66
EK: JN Architects	12.58	50.60	63.18
The McLennan Partnership	10.26	51.20	61.46
MGP Architects	14.99	36.60	51.59
Dalman Johnstone	5.57	45.80	51.37
JG Aitchison & Son	-	-	-
Block Architects	-	-	-
GC Architectural	-	-	-

**Quantity Surveyors**

<u>Firm</u>	<u>Price 40%</u>	<u>Quality 60%</u>	<u>Combined Score</u>
Carr, McLean & Watson	25.44	56.00	81.44
Robert C Brown	26.55	54.80	81.35
DMA Partnership Ltd	25.24	53.60	78.84
Ewing Sommerville Partnership Ltd	24.94	52.80	77.74
Armour Construction Consultants	23.34	53.80	77.14
Davis Langdon LLP	23.05	53.40	76.45
Thomson Bethune Ltd	22.72	52.80	75.52
Thomas J Ross	21.74	53.60	75.34
Bryan, Bryne Consultants Ltd	28.77	46.20	74.97
RLF Construction & Property Consultants	20.55	54.20	74.75
Storrier & Donaldson Ltd	21.96	52.20	74.16
Towler & Hyslop Chartered QS	20.83	52.20	73.03
The Rennie Partnership	21.90	50.80	72.70
Gleeds	18.54	53.00	71.54
Currie & Brown Group	17.16	54.00	71.16
Dickson Associates	21.18	49.60	70.78
Douglas H Dickie	22.94	45.80	68.74
Summers Inman Construction & Property	16.11	52.60	68.71
Dearle & Henderson Consultancy Ltd	11.69	52.40	64.09
Arcadis Ayh	6.51	54.40	60.91
Neilson Binnie-McKenzie	-1.16	54.00	52.84
Oak Green Construction Consultants	-	-	-
Ian Montgomery Associates	-	-	-
Ross Quality Control Ltd	-	-	-
Malcolm Hollis LLP	-	-	-
Watts Group plc	-	-	-

**Building Surveyors**

<u>Firm</u>	<u>Price 40%</u>	<u>Quality 60%</u>	<u>Combined Score</u>
CRGP Architects & Surveyors	25.61	54.60	80.21
Towler & Hyslop Chartered QS	26.42	52.20	78.62
Dearle & Henderson Consultancy Ltd	24.12	53.80	77.92
Gleeds	21.95	54.00	75.95
Craig & Struthers	16.20	53.40	69.60
Davis Langdon LLP	15.72	53.80	69.52
Thomas & Adamson Chartered QS	14.65	54.60	69.25
Summers Inman Construction & Property	15.32	53.80	69.12
CMCR Ltd	-	-	-
Construction Design Associates	-	-	-
GCA Architects Ltd	-	-	-
Malcolm Hollis LLP	-	-	-

**CDM Co-ordinators**

<u>Firm</u>	<u>Price 40%</u>	<u>Quality 60%</u>	<u>Combined Score</u>
CDM Project Safety Ltd	32.47	56.40	88.87
CDM (Scotland) Ltd	29.33	56.20	85.53
Ewing Sommerville Partnership Ltd	28.26	51.00	79.26
Bryan, Bryne Consultants Ltd	26.99	47.00	73.99
Scott Wilson	22.53	49.80	72.33
Thomson Bethune Ltd	19.23	52.60	71.83
The Safety Company (Scotland) Ltd	24.21	46.80	71.01
DMA Partnership Ltd	22.29	48.40	70.69
Carr, McLean & Watson	16.36	54.20	70.56
Gleeds	16.06	53.80	69.86
Craig & Struthers	13.40	50.60	64.00
Summers Inman Construction & Property	9.35	53.60	62.95
Dearle & Henderson Consultancy Ltd	9.18	50.80	59.98
Davie & McCulloch	10.34	48.80	59.14
Armour Construction Consultants	-	-	-
Artemis Architects Ltd	-	-	-
BPC Associates	-	-	-
Hypostyle Designs Ltd	-	-	-
Ross Quality Control Ltd	-	-	-
The McLennan Partnership	-	-	-
The Miller Partnership	-	-	-

**Structural / Civil Engineers**

<u>Firm</u>	<u>Price 40%</u>	<u>Quality 60%</u>	<u>Combined Score</u>
Pick Everard	27.72	54.20	81.92
AJ Balfour Associates	30.74	49.00	79.74
Scott Wilson	27.71	52.00	79.71
DC Farquhar & Partners	27.77	51.20	78.97
Forbes Leslie Network Ltd	24.46	51.20	75.66
Harley Haddow LLP	24.35	49.60	73.95
Dougal & Baillie Associates	22.07	51.00	73.07
Woolgar Hunter	15.75	54.40	70.15
WYG Engineering Ltd	15.43	54.00	69.43
Dinardo Partnership	-	-	-
DPS International	-	-	-
Oak Green Construction Consultants	-	-	-

**Mechanical / Electrical Engineers**

<u>Firm</u>	<u>Price 40%</u>	<u>Quality 60%</u>	<u>Combined Score</u>
Davie & McCulloch	22.96	55.00	77.96
Forbes Leslie	23.44	52.80	76.24
Wallace Whittle	21.36	54.80	76.16
NIFES Consulting Group	23.38	52.20	75.58
Harley Haddow LLP	25.16	50.20	75.36
Pick Everard	19.06	54.60	73.66
BPC Associates	21.39	51.60	72.99
Hulley & Kirkwood Consulting Engineers	19.10	52.40	71.50
Henderson Warnock	17.01	54.00	71.01
WYG Engineering Ltd	16.45	54.20	70.65
Rybka Ltd	16.15	54.40	70.55
EDP Consulting Engineers	14.53	52.60	67.13
Malcolm Hollis LLP	-	-	-

' - ' SIGNIFIES NO TENDER RETURNED