

North Lanarkshire Council Report

Policy & Strategy

approval noting

Ref

Date 31/01/20

North Lanarkshire Parking Charges Strategy

From Nicole Paterson, Head of Environmental Assets

Email Patersonn@northlan.gov.uk **Telephone** 01236 632656

Executive Summary

This report outlines work to investigate the feasibility of introducing a car park charging strategy in Council owned, public off-street car parks. Consultations were undertaken with a number of other Local Authorities across Scotland to gain a greater understanding of the practical issues relating to implementing a parking charging regime and the public feedback from those schemes.

Spatial analysis was undertaken to assess the potential impact of displaced parking and preparation on each town centre. The associated financial model to assess the potential costs and revenue income to the Council from the introduction of parking charges in off-street Council car parks for a number of different scenarios was developed.

The feasibility study concludes that the establishment of a parking charging regime for off-street Council owned car parks, as outlined in the report is feasible for certain towns in North Lanarkshire and could provide cost savings to the Council.

Recommendations

It is recommended that the Committee:

1. Agree to progress proposals to introduce off street car parking in the seven towns identified in this report at the charges identified;
2. Agree to the implementation of parking charges outlined as Option 2;
3. Authorise the Head of Environmental Assets the discretion to vary charging to meet local needs as necessary;
4. Notes that the impact of parking in the towns and surrounding streets will be monitored and additional parking restrictions and the introduction of further on street parking charges (if considered necessary) will be brought back to Committee; and
5. Notes that engagement with key stakeholders and local business representatives will be undertaken to discuss proposals and emphasise the potential benefits, including increased parking turnover and visits to local businesses and services.

The Plan for North Lanarkshire

Priority Improve North Lanarkshire's resource base

Ambition statement (3) Maximise the use of our marketable land and assets through improved development in business and industrial infrastructure

1. Background

- 1.1 At the Council meeting of 21 February 2019 the Council's revenue budget for 2019/20 was set. The Council rejected the proposals for Town Centre/Off Street Car Park Charges but instructed management to undertake a detailed analysis of the proposals for further review by members.
- 1.2 The service has undertaken a detailed review of parking charges. This included an evaluation of schemes in other local authority areas, development of proposed charging options and an assessment of the impact that charging may have on the communities next to our car parks.

2. Report

- 2.1 A review of the feasibility of introducing a charging regime within North Lanarkshire Council controlled car parks was undertaken between June and August 2019. The findings of this review support the intentions of a car parking charging regime if considered appropriate by this Committee.

Project Objectives

- 2.2 The primary objectives of this study were to:
- Investigate the feasibility of introducing a car parking regime throughout North Lanarkshire Council public car parks;
 - Undertake relevant case studies with other Local Authorities across Scotland;
 - Review the possibility of introducing discounts for businesses and individual users where costs and number of permits issued would be set by the Council to maximise the use of the car parks;
 - Investigate the potential of classifying all car parks from short stay and long stay to just long stay where on-street parking provides the short stay provision; and
 - Investigate the potential for displacement of parking from car parks and the impact on neighbouring streets.

Previous Council Savings Proposals

- 2.3 Council Officers previously investigated the potential feasibility of introducing town and village centre off-street car park charges and generated a savings proposal estimating that an annual income of around £650,000 could be realised. These estimates were based on a high level analysis and this review has provided a full cost business case providing Committee with options for these charging proposals.

Site Review

2.4 Surveys were conducted of all Council owned parking across North Lanarkshire to take observations, photographs and measurements of parking capacity and occupancy. 6,216 spaces in total were measured across 19 towns and villages. Of those spaces 74% were found to be occupied throughout the surveys. High parking occupancies were found in Condorrat (97%), Motherwell (94%), Croy (89%), Airdrie (81%), Harthill (79%), Kilsyth (74%), Wishaw (72%), Newhouse (72%) and Bellshill (71%) at the time of the surveys. One car park in particular in an area of very high demand close to Motherwell train station was found to be 180% occupied with drivers parking on verges and over double yellow lines. Given the timescales of the project, these surveys were undertaken during the school summer holidays; this would not generally be considered to provide neutral parking survey conditions and therefore car park occupancy statistics from previous studies were also utilised in the modelling of various scenarios.

Table 1 Car Park Review Data Summary

Town	Car Parks	Parking Spaces		
	Total	Total	Occupied	Occupancy
Airdrie	12	1,297	1,054	81%
Allanton	1	30	5	17%
Banton	1	8	1	13%
Bellshill	10	439	312	71%
Chapelhall	1	39	21	54%
Coatbridge	13	769	621	81%
Condorrat	1	60	58	97%
Croy	2	724	647	89%
Cumbernauld	3	440	94	21%
Harthill	3	117	93	79%
Holytown	1	18	8	44%
Kilsyth	4	205	151	74%
Mossend	2	51	15	29%
Motherwell	14	816	770	94%
Newarthill	2	52	23	44%
Newhouse	1	149	107	72%
Shotts	3	174	53	30%
Stepps	2	65	26	40%
Wishaw	15	763	550	72%
TOTALS	91	6,216	4,609	74%

Consultation

2.5 Three Case Studies were developed following engagement with a range of Local Authorities with experience of introducing off-street parking charges. This work enabled sharing their experiences and the ability to inform or model of local parking arrangements going forward. Meetings were held with South Lanarkshire Council, East Dunbartonshire Council and Angus Council, the latter of which most recently introduced off-street parking charges in November 2018. Officers from these local authorities provided very useful information and recommendations should North

Lanarkshire Council implement a parking charging regime. Key recommendations included:

- Provide a cash / coin option for payment (recent experience in Angus showed significant public opposition to an initially fully cashless payment system. Coin accepting machinery was later installed in certain car parks as a result of this pressure);
- Allow for up to a three year lead in time during which parking restrictions around town centres, stations and car parks are reviewed and restrictions and traffic orders are implemented where necessary to protect streets from possible parking displacement;
- Ensure there is early engagement with local organisations and business groups;
- Investigate the potential of introducing on-street parking charges which contribute to the wider parking management structure.

Other Local Authorities also warned of the potentially negative public feedback from parking charges and how this could take up significant Council Officer time and resources to manage.

Parking Displacement Analysis

- 2.6 A spatial analysis was undertaken of the potential impact of parking displacement from existing car parks, should parking charges be introduced. This analysis highlighted the streets and other private car parks which may be at risk of parking displacement from existing car parks and where potential restrictions or on-street parking provision could be located.

Parking Charging Regime Analysis

- 2.7 An analysis of the potential parking charging regimes which could be implemented by North Lanarkshire Council was undertaken through the creation of a financial model. Baseline information collected by Council Officers and specialist advisers was assessed for different scenarios including charging in different towns and villages throughout North Lanarkshire, in different car park types (short stay, long stay etc.) and with different charging cost range regimes. Initial scenario modelling also included the potential for an initial free period of two hours, this option was later ruled out as it was anticipated that this would not return as feasible a business case as other options and would require a more complicated system of parking enforcement. Significantly, the analysis considered the assumed suppression of parking demand in car parks based upon each proposed charging regime, with a higher anticipated displacement of parking expected in the higher cost charging regimes.
- 2.7.1 At the start of the analysis different charging regimes were proposed for different types of car parks (short stay, long stay etc.). Through the analysis the decision was made to have one single charging regime for all car parks in order to simplify the charging regime and be more user-friendly. The charging regime was developed in order to suit both long and short stay parking while it was expected that some of the on-street parking limited waiting restrictions would cater for some short stay parking.
- 2.7.2 It should be noted that due to funding arrangements with Strathclyde Partnership for Transport (SPT), North Lanarkshire is not currently permitted to charge in designated Park and Ride car parks. These car parks are therefore not currently included in the analysis.

2.7.3 The analysis indicated that there was a positive business case for implementing off street parking charges in seven of North Lanarkshire's eight towns; in Airdrie, Bellshill, Coatbridge, Cumbernauld, Kilsyth, Motherwell and Wishaw. However, it should be noted that significant works would be required prior to the introduction of charging. Whilst Shotts is a key town in North Lanarkshire, the large majority of the parking capacity is found in Shotts Station Park and Ride car park and therefore could not currently be charged. There are only two other small Council owned car parks in the town and it was therefore considered that it would not be feasible to introduce off-street parking charges for Council car parks in Shotts.

2.7.4 Table 2 shows the three cost ranges proposed for different vehicle durations of stay. These cost ranges were proposed after a benchmarking exercise was carried out against other comparable Local Authorities and were considered to represent a clear approach to parking charges. It is recommended that the Council allow the Head of Service the discretion to vary costs to ensure the most effective working of the parking charging regime for instance: reduction of charges at under-utilised car parks. An annual monitoring and evaluation programme would be established in order to assess whether the charging regime was effective and whether any changes were required to ensure optimum operation.

Table 2 Proposed Cost Ranges for Duration of Stay

Cost Range	Duration of Stay (hours)				
	1	2	3	4	5+
1	£1.00	£2.00	£3.00	£4.00	£5.00
2	£0.80	£1.20	£1.60	£2.00	£4.00
3	£0.50	£0.65	£0.80	£0.95	£2.00

2.7.5 Of the cost ranges outlined above, ranges 1 and 2 returned positive business cases for the seven towns and different charging scenarios mentioned earlier with the exception of cost range 3 which returned a negative business case.

2.7.6 Charging in all Council car parks with the exception of Park and Ride car parks in Airdrie, Bellshill, Coatbridge, Cumbernauld, Kilsyth, Motherwell and Wishaw was estimated to provide a positive net revenue to the Council of up to £642,623 annually depending on the charging regime utilised. This would also include an upfront cost for purchase and installation of ticketing machinery, car park upgrades and the enhancement of parking restrictions in town and village centres. An initial high-level estimate for the upfront cost was estimated to be in the region of £1.1M. Whilst these figures have been calculated using a range of factors, they should be taken with a note of caution. The precise drop in parking occupancy expected for different charging regimes has been assumed for each charging regime, however, the exact amount of demand suppression is very difficult to estimate given the number of unknown factors at this time. Estimates for parking demand suppression in car parks have been based upon that of other Local Authorities and assumed conditions but these could potentially be different in North Lanarkshire.

2.7.7 These estimates have been based upon a parking team of four front line enforcement staff, and a parking management team of four back room technical staff and a parking manager, however, with the inclusion of a greater number of car parks; the expansion of parking restrictions; and the potential introduction of on-street parking (not covered directly by this study), it is possible that staffing requirements and ongoing costs could therefore increase, reducing this overall revenue.

Similarly factors such as web or app-based payment facilities have not currently been included in existing financial estimates.

Table 3 Financial Modelling Estimates Summary Table

Scenario Description: Charging in all Council car parks except Park & Ride car parks in: Airdrie, Bellshill, Coatbridge, Cumbernauld, Kilsyth, Motherwell and Wishaw	Cost Range 1	Cost Range 2	Cost Range 3
Overview			
Car Parks	57	57	57
Ticketing Machines	90	90	90
Parking Capacity	3,202	3,202	3,202
Expenditure			
Estimated Annual Expenditure	£859,944	£859,944	£859,944
Income			
Total Income (Parking and PCN Income)	£1,502,566	£1,267,688	£804,989
Net Revenue			
Estimated Total Net Revenue	£642,623	£407,725	-£54,955

2.7.8 The above financial modelling has been undertaken based upon the following key assumptions:

- Penalty Charge Notice (PCN) income estimation is based upon car park PCNs alone and does not include on-street PCN notices which are already currently collected elsewhere;
- The analysis assumes cashless transactions would incur a £0.20 transaction fee from electronic payment service providers;
- Parking charges are in force Monday to Saturday with Sundays free of charge as is the case for other comparable Local Authorities;
- A Parking Team and enforcement staff are employed to manage the new parking charging regime;
- Assumed machinery costs have been based upon quotes received to date by North Lanarkshire Council from eight suppliers;
- Assumed maintenance and upkeep of machinery of 5% of capital costs per annum after one year machine warranty period;
- Parking demand is suppressed proportionately to the cost of the charge regime proposed;
- Charging would not take place in any designated Park and Ride car parks; and
- The parking charging regime is introduced alongside a detailed review of parking restrictions in town centres and in the vicinity of existing car parks in order to improve the effectiveness and reduce the impact of parking displacement on surrounding streets.

Recommendations and Next Steps

2.8 The recommendations of this study are that The Head of Environmental Assets:

- Progress proposals to introduce off street car parking in the seven towns identified in this report at the charges identified.
- Takes forward cost option 2 as the most appropriate for implementation;
- Is given authority to set individual discounts across the car parks including business and seasonal permits
- Monitors the impact of parking in the towns and surrounding streets and is given authority to progress additional parking restrictions and the introduction of on street parking charges if considered necessary
- Undertakes engagement with key stakeholders and local business representatives to discuss proposals and emphasise the potential benefits including increased parking turnover and visits to local businesses and services.

3. Equality and Diversity

3.1 Fairer Scotland Duty

The Fairer Scotland Duty does not apply.

3.2 Equality Impact Assessment

An initial screening has been undertaken and a Stage 2 Equality Impact Assessment is not required.

4. Implications

4.1 Financial Impact

The recommended proposal would require initial one off capital investment, but is anticipated to add to Council revenues.

4.2 HR/Policy/Legislative Impact

The recommended proposal to introduce a car park charging regime across North Lanarkshire's town centre car parks would require additional staff to manage and enforce parking.

4.3 Environmental Impact

These proposals anticipate a positive environmental impact as the introduction of parking charges would reduce the number of vehicles in town centres and encourage people to use more sustainable modes of transport.

4.4 Risk Impact

Risk of negative public feedback to proposals as seen in other Local Authorities. Regular review of scheme by Council Officers and communication with Council Press Team advised.

Risk of estimated revenues not being realised. Advised further investigation is undertaken and a larger evidence base collected to improve financial modelling.

5. Measures of success

5.1 Increased turnover of short stay parking spaces bringing more visitors to town centres and contributing to the local economy.

5.2 Improved parking enforcement across Local Authority.

- 5.3 Improved opportunities and links to wider Council transport initiatives and modal shift including active travel.

6. Supporting documents

- 6.1 Appendix A – List of Car Parks Proposed for Introduction of Parking Charges

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'Nicole Paterson', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Nicole Paterson
Head of Environmental Assets

Appendix A – List of car parks proposed for introduction of parking charges

Car Park Name	Ref.	Town
Callon Street	AI1	Airdrie
East High Street	AI2	Airdrie
Hallcraig Street (West)	AI3	Airdrie
Hallcraig Street (East)	AI4	Airdrie
High Street	AI5	Airdrie
Mill Loan	AI6	Airdrie
Manse Place / Louden Street (North)	AI7	Airdrie
Chapel Lane	AI9	Airdrie
Hallcraig Street (South) / Flowerhill	AI10	Airdrie
Church View Gardens	BE1	Bellshill
John Street (West)	BE2	Bellshill
Neilson Street	BE3	Bellshill
North Road	BE4	Bellshill
Crossgates	BE5	Bellshill
Gladstone Street	BE6	Bellshill
Glebe Street	BE7	Bellshill
John Street (East)	BE8	Bellshill
Bowling Green Street	BE9	Bellshill
Blairgrove	CO1	Coatbridge
Baird Street (South)	CO2	Coatbridge
Church Street (North)	CO3	Coatbridge
St John Street	CO6	Coatbridge
Whifflet Street	CO7	Coatbridge
Baird Street (North)	CO8	Coatbridge
King Street	CO9	Coatbridge
Muiryhall Street	CO10	Coatbridge
Hozier Street	CO11	Coatbridge
The Wynd / Smithyends	CU3	Cumbernauld
Airdrie Road	KL1	Kilsyth
King Street (South)	KL2	Kilsyth
King Street (North)	KL3	Kilsyth
Kingsway	KL4	Kilsyth
High Road (South)	MT1	Motherwell
MacDonald Street	MT2	Motherwell
Pollock Street (East)	MT3	Motherwell
Pollock Street (West)	MT4	Motherwell
Brandon Street	MT5	Motherwell
Coursington Road	MT6	Motherwell
High Road (North)	MT7	Motherwell
Menteith Road	MT8	Motherwell
Oakfield Drive (North)	MT9	Motherwell
Oakfield Drive (South)	MT10	Motherwell

Windmillhill Street	MT11	Motherwell
Scott Street	MT12	Motherwell
Belhaven Terrace	WI1	Wishaw
Caledonian Road	WI2	Wishaw
East Academy Street	WI3	Wishaw
Graham Street	WI4	Wishaw
Hill Street (North)	WI5	Wishaw
Kirk Road	WI6	Wishaw
Quarry Street	WI7	Wishaw
Kitchener Street	WI8	Wishaw
Russell Street	WI9	Wishaw
Hill Street (South)	WI10	Wishaw
King Street	WI11	Wishaw
Young Street (East)	WI12	Wishaw
Young Street (West)	WI13	Wishaw